

THE WTO MORATORIUM ON CUSTOMS DUTIES ON ELECTRONIC TRANSMISSIONS: **STATISTICAL SUMMARY**

IMPLICATIONS FOR DIGITAL DEVELOPMENT

"The Moratorium's expiration would have wide-ranging implications for MSMEs (Micro-, Small-, and Medium-Sized Enterprises)... There is an urgent need for greater empirical assessment of the potential impact of lifting the Moratorium on MSMEs."

Commercial Services Export Growth (since 2001)

| +300% | | | |
|---------------------|--|--|--|
| Growth in Least | | | |
| Developed Economies | | | |

+250%
Growth in Other
Developing Countries

67%: MSME share of total cross-border services exports (2021)

Sources: <u>The World Bank and the WTO, Trade in Services and Development</u> (2023); <u>New Markets Lab, The MSME Moratorium</u> (2024)

IMPLICATIONS FOR DIGITAL INCLUSION

"Applying tariffs on electronic transmissions is likely to harm efforts to make trade more inclusive, whether it be low-income country exports or the exports of smaller or women-owned firms."

6 in 10 employed women now work in the services sector, including digital services

Most rapid growth in low-income economies: **58% increase** in female employment in services (since 2001).

"The E-commerce Moratorium ... has been instrumental in the adoption of digital services by women-led or owned businesses."

Sources: The World Bank and the WTO, Trade in Services and Development (2023); Trade Experettes, The E-Commerce Moratorium & Women (2024); OECD, Understanding the potential scope, definition and impact of the WTO e-commerce Moratorium (2023)

ECONOMIC IMPACT ANALYSIS—CONTINUATION OF THE MORATORIUM

Continuation of the Moratorium enhances predictable crossborder access to digital tools and knowledge that are critical to economic opportunity. With every 1% increase in use of digital imports by MSMEs:

| | India | Indonesia | South Africa |
|------------------------------|-------|-----------|--------------|
| MSME Employment Rises by: | +0.8% | +0.42% | +0.18% |
| MSME Economic Output: | +0.2% | +0.96% | +0.47% |

Please see links for additional details re methodology and definitions.

Sources: The Impact of Cross-Border Digital Transmissions on the MSME Sector in India and the Benefits of the WTO E-Commerce Moratorium (igpp.in); Value-of-Crossborder-Digital-Transmissions-to-MSMEs-in-Indonesia.pdf (infisum.com); MSME-WTOMoratorium-SouthAfrica.pdf (infisum.com)

ECONOMIC IMPACT ANALYSIS-END OF THE MORATORIUM

If certain economies levy customs duties on electronic transmissions, and other economies retaliate in kind, the impacts could be severe. According to one analysis, impacts could include:

GDP Losses

| India | Indonesia | South Africa |
|----------------|----------------|---------------|
| -\$1.9 billion | -\$164 million | -\$25 million |

Job Losses

| -1.3 million jobs | -66,000 jobs | -10,000 jobs |
|-------------------|--------------|--------------|
| India | Indonesia | South Africa |

Source: The Economic Losses from Ending the WTO Moratorium on Electronic Transmissions | (ecipe.org)

VALUE-ADDED TAXES V. CUSTOMS DUTIES

VAT / GST CUSTOMS DUTIES ON ELECTRONIC TRANSMISSIONS Higher revenue potential: Potential revenue from VAT is 150% Low revenue potential: Between 0.01% and 0.33% of overall higher than from customs duties on electronic transmissions. government revenue for developing economies Less distortive: Taxes on domestic consumption benefit from a More distortive: Customs duties on electronic transmissions broader base of economic activity, resulting in fewer distortions would negatively affect those who can benefit the most from to production and consumption decisions, lower revenue digital delivery or from the use of digital tools to trade, namely instability, and greater gains in revenue generation. MSMFs and women-owned traders. Legal predictability: The adoption of VAT systems has grown Legal uncertainty: No country has successfully implemented a framework to collect and enforce customs duties on transient significantly in the last 30 years. As of 2022, 174 economies have implemented such taxes, and more than 120 jurisdictions electronic transmissions. are adapting or considering adapting their VAT administration to address the challenges posed by digitalization. Adapted for the digital environment: VAT administration has **Not adapted for the digital environment:** Customs duty been adapted successfully to the challenges of digitalization, frameworks are not easily administrable to ephemeral electronic across economies in all income groups, as authorities in many transmissions. This implies significant legal risk for governments and traders alike. High administrative and technical costs will economies have sought to secure their domestic tax bases. reduce the net revenue collected. Fewer unintended impacts for domestic producers: The VAT More unintended impacts for domestic producers: Tariffs is widely seen as an effective and efficient way to raise revenue, raise the cost of inputs for production and their cost falls largely especially if it has a broad base comprising all final consumption on domestic firms and consumers. Such effects can create and a single standard rate. significant distortions, biasing business decisions towards other intermediate inputs. Fewer legal risks: Moratorium does not affect governments' More legal risks. Commitments in the GATS, RTAs, and bilateral tax treaties may prohibit or restrict the imposition of customs capacity to generate revenue through non-discriminatory consumption taxes, such as VAT. duties. Tariff bindings and obligations under the GATT and the Valuation and ILP Agreements impose further conditions.

Source: IMF, OECD, UN, World Bank, World Trade Organization, Digital Trade for Development (2023); IMF, Fiscal Revenue Mobilization and Digitally Traded Products: Taxing at the Border or Behind It? (2023)



FOCUS ON INDIA

India Benefits Greatly From the Moratorium. India Is Also Uniquely Vulnerable to its Expiration.

"India has experienced a digital boom at an impressive scale ... that has ushered in corresponding economic benefits for the economy and people..."

| +400% | 60% | 50% | 50% |
|--|--|---|--|
| Growth in India's share of global digital exports (1995 to 2015) | Share of all Indian services exports that are digital (2021) | Indian MSME Share of all Indian exports (2021) | Approximate share of India's digital exports bound for the United States |

"The question for India is not "if" but "how" and "by how much" its growth engine—the MSME sector—can take advantage of the potential benefits of cross-border digital transmissions."

A collapse of the WTO Moratorium could significantly undermine these potential benefits.

Source: The Impact of Cross-Border Digital Transmissions on the MSME Sector in India and the Benefits of the WTO E-Commerce Moratorium (igpp.in)